

An Evaluative of Hangzhou's International Tourism Using Triangulation

Bob Lee, PhD

Associate Professor
Tourism, Leisure and Event Planning
School of Human Movement
Sports and Leisure Studies
Bowling Green State University
Bowling green, Ohio
USA

Yu Liu, PhD

Qiuju Wang, PhD

Associate Professor
Department of Economy and Tourism
Tourism College
Beijing Union University, Beijing
China

David Groves, DEd

Professor
Tourism, Leisure and Event Planning
School of Human Movement
Sports and Leisure Studies
Bowling Green State University
Bowling green, Ohio
USA

Abstract

Triangulation is a method that uses a variety of approaches to compare data points in order to identify issues from a number of perspectives and get to root causes that influence destination development. It provides a perspective that a singular evaluation cannot provide because the different data points provide a way to identify a common core of issues as well as those that present a different viewpoints. Hangzhou tourism program was triangulated using their database, mystery guest, and the big data source trip advisor. Hangzhou is a very unique destination once experienced and, if programmed correctly, will have a great depth of experience that will attract travelers to come back and visit again. It is the intangible dimensions that have made it so popular with the domestic tourists. It is essential that these intangible qualities be programmed through effective niche marketing so that the traveler can understand the uniqueness and beauty of the destination.

Key Words: Triangulation, Destination Evaluation, Big Data, Trip Advisor, Mystery Guest, and Niche Marketing

1.0 Overview

Hangzhou is one of the cultural and historical centers of China's tourism. It is an urban area with substantial population that has a charm of no other city in China. The tourism numbers are substantial and have had a great impact on the city's development and residents' lives. In addition to the heavy tourism, Hangzhou is a commercial and industrial center.

Like the Silicon Valley in the United States, there is very little heavy industry and a focus upon light industry and technology. Clearly, Hangzhou is an organic tourism and leisure destination, especially for domestic tourists. The infrastructure of the tourism industry in Hangzhou is very sophisticated with multiple attractions and themes. This city has great energy and tradition. These traditions are the glue that holds the city together and attracts numerous visitors.

2.0 Purpose

The purpose of this study was to recognizing the accomplishments and identifying issues through evaluating process that influence tourism development in Hangzhou.

(Ben-Dalia, Collins-Kreiner, & Churchman, 2013; Griffin & Edwards, 2012) The goal is to gather evidence and make recommendations for improvement, as well as a new approach to sustainable development.

It must be recognized that Hangzhou already has an effective, as well as, efficient tourism industry. Therefore, it is often very difficult to discuss improvement upon existing systems that are effective and have been tested through time. A qualitative, triangulation research approach was used for this project. (Fifolt, 2013) The three data sources for the information were the 2012 Hangzhou Tourism Survey, Trip Advisor, and Mystery Guest through personal observations of travel professionals. Each of these data sources were reviewed to obtain facts and figures and core team of experts reviewed the data to make recommendations and suggestions. These three data sources were triangulated to isolate a common data point. (Brunton & Jeffrey, 2010; Fotheringham, 2010) The Tourism Survey's method was a cursory review of the data to identify important information points that have implications for improvement of developmental issues. A thematic content analysis was used for the review. The primary theme was developmental issues. The Trip Advisor methodology was a concept organization method in which key statements were classified, based upon the relationships between words that characterized statements provided by travelers. The primary computer program used was the "personal brain" which categorizes word relationships. The Mystery Guest methodology was seven tourism professionals who visited the Hangzhou area to identify key developmental issues. Key attractions were visited and professionals and visitors, who are intimately associated with the attraction, were interviewed. The tourism professionals met to discuss their findings and prioritize issues that have and will influence development.

3.0 Status/Transition, Review 2012 survey

In reviewing the 2012 survey, there is evidence that the planning authority has done an outstanding job in maintaining and improving tourism in Hangzhou. The indicator of this is the steady growth of the industry in terms of numbers and revenue. It is also evident that the planning authority is using a strategic plan to ensure the future of tourism by an aggressive developmental program. This program is changing the face of tourism. Tourism is being diversified to change the nature of the experience. There is further evidence that this development is in a state of transition. The planning authority is struggling with integrating the old establishment and the new development. It is also struggling in trying to integrate an urban commercial and industrial center with rural agricultural attributes.

Upon the success of the city's transition and integration of resources, Hangzhou, with her unique resource, rich history, and wealth traditions, can position herself as one of top ranked international tourism destinations. Nevertheless, the nature of the destination can only be determined when all the construction and attractions are complete. There will then be branding or image issues that will have to be developed to coincide with the changes that have been made in Hangzhou.

As a domestic tourism destination, Hangzhou has established a substantial reputation among regional residents as well as Chinese provinces. The new development must not destroy what has been established in the past. There must be a very delicate integration of the new to the old during the next tourism developmental stage.

The proposed changes will allow a new mix of tourism products and creation of an international destination that will encourage the tourist (Domestic and International) to increase the number of days of his/her stay. The new development will bring new images that will be able to compete with other international destinations. Again, the key will be not to destroy the old, but to develop a compatible set of attractions that will complement the current images.

There has been a very effective international marketing campaign proposed by the tourism authority in Hangzhou to coincide with the new developments. This marketing effort is reaching out to new international audiences. The campaign has created a number of new images for Hangzhou that correspond with a new development and an attempt to establish Hangzhou as a tourism destination, coupled with many specialized programs. This marketing campaign is primarily a mass marketing approach and multiple images are being developed to reach a diversity of audiences.

With the new development, new revenue centers can be generated from foreign visitors. Currently, shopping is the largest. However, more revenue can be generated from accommodations, sightseeing, food, and beverage and entertainment services. Additional revenue can also be generated from amenities.

It must be pointed out that these additional revenues will also be more likely to help increase the length of stay of a visitor from an average of 2.95 to 5 nights (Foreign Visitors).

Domestic tourism revenues can also be increased by changing the purpose of the visit from sight-seeing to active involvement of multiple programs. This will also result in an increase in the number of days of visitation from 2.2 to 4 (Domestic Visitors).

In regard to the infrastructure, there are two elements that are very important: the number of hotel rooms and international direct flights. The hotel rooms are low in Hangzhou compared to the total number of visitors. The number of international direct flights is quite limited to destinations other than Asian and Oceania countries. The existing hotel capacity in relation to millions of annual visitors is small. Most of the domestic visitors are regional or have made arrangements to stay with family or friends, but with the vision of developing as an international destination, capacity may have to be increased as the number of international visitors increase. Additionally, it is essential that if Hangzhou is going to be a true world tourism destination, the number of direct flights have to be increased to match the departure destinations. The other aspect that needs to be explored, based on infrastructure, is marketing. Most of the marketing has been extensive and is very appropriate for saturation/mass marketing. This is essential in creating an identity with a destination, but a niche approach may be necessary to complement the mass marketing to reach the desired audiences and target the message on an individual basis.

Table 1: 2012 Hangzhou Tourism Survey Summary

This survey is a comprehensive review of data that reflects the longitudinal status of the Hangzhou tourism industry.

Inbound

3,311,200 person-times increase 8.1 %

2,202 billion USD increase 12.5%

Domestic

82,368,800 person-times increase 14.7%

125,317 billion RMB (Renminbi) increase 17.8%

Total Gross Revenue 139,225 billion RMB increase 16.9%

PA

The planning authority for HANGZHOU has aggressively pursued the development of infrastructure and programs to increase tourism. The direct result has been a steady increase in the number of tourists and revenues from these efforts. An essential part of this development is constant assessment and the development of standards for the delivery of services. The planning authority is in its third round of international strategic planning. The primary focus of the strategy is the integration of tourism into the other industries for the development of common economic policy. The strategy is based upon innovation, immigration, and synergy. Hangzhou has the difficulty of integrating urban and rural systems.

Page 1

Investment

Investment in terms of capital project is a direct indicator of the aggressiveness of the planning authority to develop Hangzhou. There are 113 projects on the drawing board and 107 under construction with a total investment of 113,418 billion Yuan. This includes new development as well as the preservation and conservation of historic sites.

The array of development is from sports to culture to agriculture. These projects reflect the new and the old and the development of diversity of tourist attractions.

Page 7

Marketing

Marketing included international tourism shows, famous tourism magazines, bus ads, and cooperation with international travel agencies. In addition domestic travel fairs were attended to promote Hangahou. New festivals were developed with specific themes to emphasize the uniqueness of Hangahou and regard to specific attractions, wedding tours, special holidays, shopping, industrial tourism, folklore, agricultural products, and electronic products. In addition, convention and exhibition ads were taken out in magazines. A special convention and incentive program was held to attract potential clients.

Page 8

Significant Statistics

Inbound

Fifth largest inbound major tourist city inferior to Shenzhen, Guangzhou, Shanghai, and Beijing
Third among sub providential inferior to Shenzhen and Guangzhou

Page 12

Inbound percentages by region

Asia 42.11%, Korea, Japan, Thailand, Malaysia, Singapore, and Indonesia,

Europe 12.1% Germany, Spain, France, Britain

America 9.53% increase 17.1% USA and Canada

Page 14

Average stay for inbound tourist was 2.95 days

Page 17

Average expenditure inbound was to 225.66 USD per capita per tourist day

A breakdown of expenditures was:

Long distance transport 28.9%

Accommodations 14.5%

Sightseeing 3.7%

Food and beverage 7.1%

Shopping 25.2%

Entertainment for 4.4%

Local traffic 3%

Post and communication 2.9%

Other 10.3%

Page 18

Domestic

Domestic tourist spend an average of 2.2 days

Page 46

Main destination of outbound tourist is Asian and Oceana locations with small amount to Europe

Page 48

Purpose of visit:

Sightseeing 41.1%

Vacation and 23.3%

Visiting family and friends 10.1%

Business 11.6%

Meetings 4.8%

Health and Therapy 1.4%

Religious Pilgrimage 0.8%

Sport, Science, and Technology 1.6%

Page 44

Geographic location of visitors:

55.4% from surrounding and nearby markets

Page 45

Per capita expenditures was 1,521 .41 RMB increased 2.7%
Per capita expenditures for overstay was 2,125.57 RMB per day
Per capita expenditures for one day was 755.88 RMB

Page 46

Policy to Manage Tourism

Odd and even license plates
Tourism distribution center
Public bicycle transportation

Page 53

Primary objectives

Satisfaction of the tourist
Crackdown on illegal behavior
Establish records for tourism guides
Star ratings
Specialized inspections
Address tourism complaints
Conflict resolution

Pages 58 and 59

Marketing Efforts

UK and German
Japan
Event promotion
Travel fairs/ bronze medal Golden City Gate
Marko Polo/ contemporary
Sister cities
Micro movies/ theme
CNN program
Social media/London Olympics
Bus advertisement
Coop with 3 largest travel services
Fam trips
MICE involvement
Ambassadors program/high end meetings
Ten international MICE conferences
International conferences
Pages 64 and 65

Construction Projects

113 projects, currently 107 under construction
Investment 113,418 billion RMD
Extensive rural tourism development
Agriculture demonstrations
25 rural tourism spots
Beautiful village exhibition
5 village facilities were currently assessed for development
Industrial tourism/steel/jade/food
Wensli group
Sports/river tracing/hiking/orienteering/para sailing
Development of rated scenic areas
Westlake and two Rivers one lake development
Grant canal
Two banks of three Rivers
Pages 68 and 69

Hotels and Restaurants

217 star rated hotels
32,439 guest rooms
58,003 beds
Occupancy rate 58.76%
Average room rate 407.99 Yuan per night
Operating revenue 11,372 million Yuan
Operating profits 3,173 million Yuan increase 4.4%
Total profit 658 million RMB
Page 79

Travel Service

606 travel services providers
557 in domestic and inbound
Outbound 50
Revenue 14,373 million RMB increase 4.2%
Page 82

Education and Training

14 sessions
56 classes
15,800 trainees
U.N. MICE tourism training/leadership
Training/personnel/food and beverage/housekeeping/engineering
Tour guide qualification/certification
Skill competitions
Page 90 and 91

Potential Industry Development

Hangzhou has an aggressive plan for development for diversifying product categories and defining directions for future development. These include upgrading of already successful endeavors such as culture, sport and leisure, weddings, shopping, etc. It calls for the development of more festivals such with food, paper umbrellas, gems and jewelry, etc. This new development is themed and branding will be difficult to meet the new integrated markets. New ways have to be found to market image around focused promotions.
Page 94 and 95

4.0 Trip Advisor

The second data point used for this analysis was the web site of Trip Advisor. This is a form of big data and represents a data set that is sensitive to the identifying of issues that influence a particular destination.(Mack, 2013; Procter, Vis, & Voss, 2013; Purcell, 2013) It is specific and related to attributes and must be mined using a technique like concept organization to provide a perspective. This type of perspective is based upon defining relationship among specific points of data. (Brandstadter, ; Harms, & Grobschedl, 2012 ; Lobb, Pinto, & Lofters , 2013; Schiller, *et al.*, 2013; Zaitseva, Milsom, & Stewart, 2013) Data analysis will be divided into two sections: one that deals with the infrastructure and the other destination assessment based upon travelers questions. Comments were reviewed by three content professionals to obtain a perspective regarding infrastructure, as well as destination assessment.

Trip Advisor is a site where travelers can evaluate hotels, restaurants, attractions. The comments on infrastructure were selected for review from the top and bottom of the ratings in order to get a contrast of the issues.

The destination assessment is where travelers could ask questions and gain replies from travelers who have visited the destination. There is the question about the quality and credibility of the replies. Most travel commissions also monitor trip advisor and have individuals responsible for replies. It must be noted that some of the people providing replies were self-promoting and some of these responses have been removed from the database. Some of the replies were asking for the individual's response and this may be dangerous. There were a total of 768 questions with numerous follow-up replies. The questions were posted from July 26, 2005 to June 23, 2013. This is a big data base and it can be used to baseline tourism issues in a destination. Comments were reviewed in order to obtain insight into the issues raised for this research project.

(Cho & Sung, 2012; Law & Kua, , 2009; Tanrisevdi & Duran, 2011) The “personal brain” program was used to help develop the framework.

To highlight key findings, tables were prepared with keyword lists to give an indication about the topics discussed.

4.1 Infrastructure

The data on infrastructure of the hotels, restaurants, and attractions gave an indication about the quality of facilities and services in Hangzhou.

Hotels, restaurants, and attractions all had excellent evaluations. They are the critical elements of infrastructure. The majority of the assessments were a rating of 4 out of 5 (Five being the best highest quality).

Lodging is a critical infrastructural complement to tourism services. Most of the hotels had excellent ratings and these ratings depended upon location, price, service, and staff. The negative comments focused on location and cleanness of the facilities. In regard to the bed and breakfast, the positive ratings were associated with the atmosphere, as well as price. The negative ratings were dependent upon management and not keeping the facilities in proper order. The specialty accommodations’ positive ratings were mostly related to price and location. Negative ratings were associated with bad management and poor services.

Food in many destinations is the primary attraction. In Hangzhou, tea was a very important part of many travelers’ experience. Positive ratings depended upon atmosphere and the quality of the food. Negative ratings were caused by negative atmosphere and poor services.

Attractions are the backbone of the tourists' experience. Positive ratings were directly dependent upon creating an environment that provides enrichment and diversity.

Other key elements of infrastructure are activities, nightlife, and shopping. Only a positive rating word list was provided. There were no word lists for nightlife because there were not enough responses for ratings. Positive ratings in regard to activity were related to creating a proper environment. There were some limited responses so the conclusions have limited meaning. Shopping also is directly related to the environment and how it is created. There were also limited responses and the meaning of the word list is hard to determine.

The common thread through the infrastructure is one of location and creating the proper environment, so that the experiences can be developed in an orderly manner. With the proper environment positive attitudes are created, but have limited influence or effect. The environment can create the positive ratings, but it also depends upon the depth of the experience to regulate interpretations of the individuals’ experiences to their own satisfaction, and the desire for more of an experience in the destination location.

Table 2: Trip Advisor/Infrastructure/Accommodations

Type	N	5	4	3	2	1	Positive comment	Negative comments
hotel	1595	38	704	410	29	3	Great location Great prize Great service Good staff Great buffet	Hard to find No water Lost booking information Poor environment Bad sanitation Dirty No windows Bad odor/smells Bathrooms
B&B	114	4	25	24	3	1	Good location Price Food Friendly Very personal Good service	Poorly managed Not friendly Mechanical Poor location Dirty
Specialty	108	4	44	13	1	0	Easy to find Good location Comfortable Well priced Good service Quiet	Poorly managed Not clean Hard to find Bad neighborhood Poor location No Computer System for booking No water Poorly priced
Restaurants			451	54	9			Food not well prepared Not clean Poor location Crowded Selection bad Too long of a wait Menu confusing Bathrooms
Attractions	151						Relaxing Peaceful Lots to do with no money Chinese culture Places to get tea close by Scenic places to visit Lake beautiful	
Outdoor 45 Culture 42 Landmarks 23 Museums 13 Amusement 12 Sports 6 Zoos and aquariums 4 Performance 1								
entertainment	101						Places to relax Easy to find Good bike system Private tours great	
Activities 13 Nightlife 4								
Shopping 84	84						Great souvenirs Great escape Good location Malls Good soak shops Relaxing Good selection	

4.2 Assessment of Destination

The destination assessment is a data point through time and can give the longitudinal overview of the issues and concerns from travelers. However, it should be recognized that these comments will represent a specific population and does not characterize all visitors to an area. As the issues are developed, a demographic and psychographic profile can be created in order to obtain some kind of indication about the nature of these types' travelers. Data was reviewed by themes. If a theme was recurring, it was an issue that was worth further investigation. It is the connection of these themes in the context of a destination that determine the utilization of emerging issues for the development of applications and recommendations to a destination. (Chen, Lin, & Petrick, 2013)

Some of the characteristics among individuals who use trip advisor were that they are independent travelers; they try to research their trips. In their mind, Hangzhou is usually a side trip on a grand tour. Individuals who visit Hangzhou for an extended stay are those coming for business or professional endeavors.

Most individuals were visiting Hangzhou because of West Lake and some of the traditional attractions. With limited time, many of these individuals on a grand tour do not take the opportunity to appreciate the culture and history of Hangzhou. Many others use Hangzhou as a hub for visiting such places as Watertown, the tea plantations, mountain attractions, etc. Hangzhou needs to be marketed as a destination to increase the number of days of visit. Most individuals visit between two - three days and some even tried to do it in one day. Geographically speaking, Shanghai, a nearby world capital city, is a destination and Hangzhou is a side trip or an escape from Shanghai. With much more to offer, such as history, tradition, natural and cultural resources, Hangzhou need to be developed as a tourism destination and marketed as a hub of regional culture and history. One of the challenges is the accessibility to Hangzhou. Most airlines often use Shanghai as a hub to eastern China. Thus, the cost of a flight into Hangzhou is an issue. Even though Asian Airlines flies into Hangzhou with reasonable prices, people are looking beyond Hangzhou for tourism experiences. What really attracts international tourists now is an inexpensive flight, not a real perception in Hangzhou.

There is no depth offering in the current tourist experiences. Some travelers even questioned the unique nature of the West Lake area. The depth is the key to the development of Hangzhou as a tourist hub from other destinations compared to the surrounding Asian countries. The other element that comes into play is the fact that the tourists do not understand the culture and history of Hangzhou. They have to be educated before their arrival as to what they can expect to see and to develop an understanding of their experience. Many international visitors have the concept of the Great Wall, Forbidden City, etc. as their expectations. These are physical attractions and easily understood. Hangzhou is a part of the cultural heritage of China. Domestic tourists understand it well, but not international tourists. However, it is the intangible atmosphere of Hangzhou that makes it an attractive destination, in addition to its beauty and serenity.

Another issue is of transportation infrastructure. There are many questions about transportation to and from Hangzhou. Visitors asked many questions about connections, as well as transportation, from one attraction to the other. Transportation services are of quality but there is a problem with coordination. There are some comments about transportation services with late arrivals and the ability to obtain services to hotels and other destinations. The one particular mode of transportation that people desire was taxis. Taxis often were in the wrong places or are not available. There was a language barrier in the use of taxis. There was also some difficulty in determining whether or not it was an official taxi.

Language was not only a problem with taxis, but also with other tourism services. This includes hotels, food, shopping, etc. It definitely limits tourism activities that make the tourists anxious and feel uncomfortable. Even though the people of Hangzhou were very friendly and welcoming, language was a barrier for residents to interact with tourists. One of the solutions to this problem was to hire tourism guides. In most cases, this has worked very well, but the tourist was at the mercy of the guide whether shopping, selecting food items on the menu, etc. A primary concern was not one of friendliness, but authenticity, in relation to developing a relationship that was genuine. Guides have been the linchpin of the tourist trade in Hangzhou. Identifying a good guide is necessary. But even more important to the success of developing foreign tourism is the education of local residents. The other key elements to travelers were safety and security. They want to be assured that they are able to make the necessary arrangements for their comfort and security. Many of the arrangements cannot be made in advance in regard to transportation, taxis, etc. There is a difference, at this point, between security and safety.

Many of the questions were related to the element of safety. These primary questions were related to crime, being ripped off, etc. Safety, in this context, is knowing how to interact with the environment so they are being treated fairly and that they are enjoying themselves in a harmless environment.

Another aspect of assessment focuses on existing facilities and services. Foreign tourists expected the toilet paper and traditional western style toilets. When they encounter no toilet paper and squat toilets this was disconcerting. The cleanliness of rooms was another essential element, as well as such things as television service that has current news in the visitors' language. Another concern was the desk clerks in hotels and their ability to provide information, especially about recommendations for restaurants, taxis, etc. Equally important was what time of year for foreigners to visit Hangzhou because of concerns about crowdedness due to the large number of domestic tourists. Weekends and holidays often make it very crowded and essential services are at their limits. The foreign tourists find it more difficult during these times.

Table 3: Word List Trip Advisor/Destination Assessment

Hangzhou to....
Hangzhou in December
Travel app for China
Day trip enough
Impressions West Lake tickets
Best travel from Hanzhou to....
Travel from....to Hanzhou
Walking to/from Impression West Lake
Hanzhou hotel advice
Taxi to airport early morning
Fast train to....
Family and children in Hanzhou
Best attractions around Hanzhou
Recommendations for English speaking driver with van
Cruises in Hanzhou
Best day trip attractions in Hanzhou
Best transportation to Airport
Lingyin temple wall sign
Tailored dresses-ready in two days
Chinese new year recommendations because of crowds
Transportation to Hanzhou....
Ticket window at Hanzhou station
Pre wedding photographs....
Pickpockets at West Lake
English speaking restaurants
Tea plantation/worth a visit
Catholic Sunday mass in Hanzhou
Luggage storage while visiting Hanzhou
Hanzhou sightseeing....
Toilet facilities
Which hotel as the best location
Restaurant suggestions
How much does transportation cost to....
Getting around....
Impression West Lake seats
How do I know if a taxi is licensed
Getting from Hanzhou to....during the night
Airport shuttle bus
Hanzhou at night....
Need local guide to maximize short trip to Hanzhou

Song Dynasty City worth a visit
Banyan Tree charging more than 10% service charge and 5% tax
Hanzhou characterless
First trip to Hanzhou....need help
China tour from Toronto....transportation
Getting to Hanzhou from the United States
Arriving late in Hanzhou transportation problem
Are there dedicated cycling tracks in Hanzhou
Cooking classes for foreigners....
Hiking guide
Hanzhou wedding
West Lake youth hostel
Budget accommodations
Acupuncture
Shopping in Hanzhou
Using North American Computer in Hanzhou

5.0 Mystery Guest

The purpose of this approach was to verify the data points and to identify additional issues that need to be addressed as Hangzhou is changing its tourism mix. With the development of the new projects underway, Hangzhou will have to develop new strategies to use these attractions to draw new tourists, especially foreign visitors. These new attractions will significantly change the landscape of Hangzhou tourism. The other aspect is to identify issues that may be influencing factors for improvement of current tourism in Hangzhou.

The third method used for data collection was Mystery Guest. (Allison, Severt, & Dickerson, 2010; Anderson, *et al.*, 2001; Rood & Dziadkowiec, 2010) Mystery Guest is a methodology that is widely used in the hospitality industry. The primary purpose is to identify issues and assess performance. In this particular case, it was only used to identify issues that may be influencing tourism. The study was conducted during a holiday season to assess the facilities and services being provided. Visitors are usually actual tourists and are visiting the area in a normal role. In this study, visitors were professional tourism individuals who have an expertise in evaluation and assessment of facilities and services. They were instructed to visit the areas of Hangzhou and seek out tourism attractions, hotels, restaurants, etc. These individuals also talk to a number of people everyday who provide services to tourists. These professionals have knowledge specializing in the tourism field, and they observe tourists every day and interact with service-providers.

There were seven mystery guests in this Hangzhou project. Three of them were foreigners and four were native Chinese. They were all tourism professionals skilled in observation and questioning skills. The observation period was five days. Individuals, from the tourism commission to street sweepers, were interviewed and observed. The distribution of people interviewed were: top tourism officials-four, travel professionals-three, conference professionals-three, escorts-three, hospitality professionals-three, hotel professionals-five, restaurant professionals-six, attraction professionals-eight, cab drivers-four, foreign visitors-ten, operation professionals-six, and event specialist-four. As a result, important concepts were identified and the key elements were discussed and formed into issues in relation to the other two previously discussed data points.

5.1 Findings

The municipal government has done a good job in developing resources in that tourism industry. There was significant numbers of tourists in the area of West Lake, a world heritage site. The planning authority has developed a strategic plan to ensure the future growth of the tourist industry. They are not depending on the reputation, but seeking new avenues to develop business.

The domestic tourists were the majority and the foreign tourists were small in number. The greatest growth will come from the foreign contingency. Most local residences in Hangzhou do not have an understanding of these types of visitors. This was evident from their facial expressions when foreign visitors were near. It is also important to be noted that the residents and domestic visitors were very knowledgeable about Chinese culture and heritage. These domestic tours even considered foreigners as invaders in their space. Their culture and heritage is sacred. Ways have to be found to educate residents and domestic visitors about the value of the foreign tourist.

Residents must become a part of the story. Their lifestyle is the rest of the story about Hangzhou. Their life and culture and the connection to the past is the obvious hidden treasure of tourism within Hangzhou. The mystery guests saw individuals singing their heritage songs in the public square and saw disabled residents developing arts and crafts for tourism products. Both of these events indicate the uniqueness of Hangzhou's culture and heritage. It is important for the government to understand that heritage tourism is a part of community development and this can help raise the standard of living. This helps the community understand and feel good about it and projects a positive image to visitors.

Another aspect to be noted is of industrial heritage or tourism. There is already a focus on this type of tourism. This aspect of tourism needs to be expanded because it is the link between the urban development and heritage. As the industrial base of urban environment expands, it provides a platform for future tourism development. It also provides a perspective to learn the past and helps to understanding how the community has developed. The same approach will also work for rural areas. It is the interaction between rural and urban that provides the evolutionary understanding of the past, present, and future of community development. As a result, for tourism development, this provides an urban center with an historical focus.

Heritage, in terms of understanding the evolutionary development of population, is a key to the hidden treasures of Hangzhou. There is a need for visitors to experience life in Hangzhou with its heritage. Extensive programming is essential for this type of experience. It is the active involvement that can provide in depth understanding of local culture and heritage. The selected programs must have some forms of entertainment base in order to attract the tourist and help them develop an interest in exploring the culture and history. Tourism is not a single experience, but many, and is, often, layered. The depth of the experience is crucial. The experience should be guided from entertainment to education. Tourism experiences have to be well-programmed so that many visits are desired and each one will gain more depth experience. Each experience is designed to generate a greater understanding of the culture and heritage.

The current emphasis in tourism is West Lake, and other forms of traditional tourism attractions. As a result, foreign tourists have a very limited view of Hangzhou and do not explore the culture and heritage of this area. They are looking for a "wow" experience from the physical and do not understand that the greater impacts of Hangzhou are intrinsic and intangible. It is evident, because of the geographic location of Hangzhou, it needs to be marketed as a tourist destination or a hub to closer destinations. The grand tour is important to maintain numbers of tourists. The development of the hub or destination concept is an important step to future tourism efforts. Each aspect of Hangzhou must be marketed to specific niches so that programs can be developed to accent the uniqueness of this region and highlight Hangzhou as the hub. Currently, mass marketing and a product approach are being used to promote foreign visitors. This has yielded good results, but a niche marketing approach must be used to expand the number of tourist from foreign destinations. The infrastructure has been well planned, but it is the integration of this infrastructure of the old and the new into unique themes that will make a difference in the success of tourism in the future. This infrastructure must be well programmed to encourage active involvement of participants and not just a passive enjoyment of physical facilities. The passion and pride of the people make the difference in having the attractions come to life for the visitors. Of these programs, visitors' experiences have to be told in terms of stories of the people's lives, culture, history, and industry. This type of program will not only help with foreign visitors, but with domestic visitors. It will also help deepen their understanding of Hangzhou to the culture and history of China and the unique position of Hangzhou's past, present, and future.

In addition to the local residents, the tourism officials and professionals have to be the leaders and developers of these new programs. Tourism authorities in Hangzhou have done an excellent job in the past. The new challenge in tourism administration today is to address the issues of change from the top down using a planning model based upon participatory planning. This involves change and it is not easy. This type of change has to evolve and be guided by practical programs that have been tested and not fully implemented until they can be successful. It should also be emphasized that all the elements of a tourism puzzle must fit well. Once this puzzle is fully implemented, the industry may outshine the other commercial and industrial interests. It is in the amenities that will make the difference in taking Hangzhou to the next level of tourism development. The change is necessary for new and long term development. Once tourism is built with a sustainable long term plan, its impacts will bring in a consistent flow of money, regardless of the economic conditions.

Finally, Hangzhou, in addition to its beauty and culture, also has a very safe environment. Many foreign visitors are looking for this type of environment for their friends and family. They also desire a friendly environment that has centuries of culture and history in which they can attach their life to the lives of the places where they visit.

This study is not only about status, but more about issues that need to be addressed as Hangzhou looks to its future. The manuscript is not comprehensive, but only suggestive of additional research needed to formulate long-term integration plans with the new developments that are occurring.

Table 4: Word List Mystery Guest

Television
Language
Friendliness
Strange looks
Bathroom
Rooms well appointed
Food
Airport
Desk clerk service
Jet lag
Air conditioning in few places
Traffic
Education/culture
Transportation
Hangzhou in transition
Urban/not pretty city
Environmental condition/air quality
Hotel services lacking
Different culture
Passion about Hangzhou
Stories/ancient as well as contemporary
Alternate culture
Residents' part of culture
Harmony
Peace
Beauty
Residence satisfied with life
Residents do not like tourist
Resident relocation
Too many people
Atmosphere not international/very alien
Safe
Information systems
Commercial and industrial
Need escort/some not friendly
Escort makes decision for visitors
Sick from food
Bicycles system very good
Unique food
See people's passion
Tea/quality
Government showcases places
Once visit Hangzhou/best tourist destination in China
Before visit know nothing about Hangzhou
Government makes difference in people's lives
Tourism cooperation cluster

6.0 Conclusion

The triangulation has led to a different pattern of issues that will confront Hangzhou as its strategic plan is being refined. It is essential to address these issues so that a plan can be effectively implemented. Hangzhou will become an international tourist destination in time, but if the issues identified are addressed, the time will be compressed for the destination to reach international status equivalent to their domestic tourism. Hangzhou is a very unique destination once experienced and if programmed correctly, will have a great depth of experience that will attract travelers to come back and visit again. It is the intangible dimensions that have made it so popular with the domestic tourists. It is essential that these intangible qualities be programmed through effective niche marketing so that the traveler can understand the uniqueness and beauty of the destination.

Triangulation is a method that can help identify issues from a number of perspectives and get to the root issues that have an influence in tourism destinations. It provides perspective that a singular evaluation cannot provide. The nature of the findings and recommendations represent common perspectives that give rise to an understanding that is causal. A destination must understand basic factors and causes to implement an effective program.

7.0 Recommendations

The following are the key issues that were identified in this evaluation. The recommendations are based upon the convergence of the three data points.

- 1). Niche marketing for groups with special interests, as well as FIT's/marketing and program specialists educated to this approach
- 2). Involvement of more tour companies with a focus on niche marketing and programming
- 3). An integration plan for developing new images that represent old and new development
- 4). Create a destination concept to add to the grand tour business
- 5). Develop Fam programs for travel agents/tour companies/specialty certification for travel agents
- 6). Development of education programs for visitors
- 7). Develop training programs for tourism professionals to relate to destination tourists
- 8). Develop educational programs for residents so they can become involved in the tourism industry and raise the standard of living
- 8). More fully develop the intangible nature of tourism so tourists can feel the atmosphere as it relates to culture and history

References

- Allisson, P.; Severt, D.; Dickson, D. (2010) A Conceptual Model for Mystery Shopping Motivations. *Journal of Hospitality Marketing & Management*. 19(6), 629-657.
- Anderson, D.N.; Groves, D.L.; Lengfelder, J.; Timothy, D. (2001) A Research Approach to Training: a Case Study of Mystery Guest Methodology. *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management*. 13(2), 93 – 102.
- Ben-Dalia, S.; Collins-Kreiner, N.; Churchman, A. (2013) Evaluation of an Urban Tourism Destination. *Tourism Geographies*, 15(2), 233-249.
- Brandstadter, K.; Harms, U.; Grobschedl, J. (2012) Assessing System Thinking Through Different Concept-Mapping Practices. *International Journal of Science Education*. 34(14), 2147-2170.
- Brunton, M.A.; Jeffrey, L.M. (2010) Using the Critical Incident Technique for Triangulation and Elaboration of Communication Management Competencies. *Journal of Vocational Education & Training*. 62(3), 239-255
- Chen, C.; Lin, Y.; Petrick, J.F. (2013) Social Biases of Destination Perceptions. *Journal of Travel Research*. 52(2), 240-252.
- Cho, M.; Sung, H.H. (2012) Travel Destination Websites: Cross-Cultural Effects on Perceived Information Value and Performance Evaluation. *Journal of Travel & Tourism Marketing*. 29(3), 221-241.
- Fifolt, M.M. (2013) Applying Qualitative Techniques to Assessment in Student Affairs. *Assessment Update*. 25(4), 5-13.
- Fotheringham, D. (2010) Triangulation for the Assessment of Clinical Nursing Skills: A review of Theory, Use and Methodology. *International Journal of Nursing Studies*. 47(3), 386-391.
- Griffin, T.; Edwards, D. (2012) Importance-Performance Analysis as a Diagnostic tool for Urban Destination Managers. *Anatolia: An International Journal of Tourism & Hospitality Research*. 23(1), 32-48.
- Law, R.; Kua, T. (2009) Analyzing the Quality of E-mail Responses of Leading Hotels of the World to Customer Enquiries, *Journal of Quality Assurance in Hospitality & Tourism*. 10(3), 175-193.
- Lobb, R.; Pinto, A.D.; Lofters, A. (2013) Using Concept Mapping in the Knowledge-to-Action Process to Compare Stakeholder Opinions on Barriers to Use of Cancer Screening among South Asians. *Implementation Science*. 8(1), 1-12.
- Mack, T. (2013) Foresight as Dialogue. *C. Futurist*, 47 (2), 46-50.
- Procter, R.; Vis, F.; Voss, A. (2013) Reading the Riots on Twitter: Methodological Innovation for the Analysis of Big Data. *International Journal of Social Research Methodology*. 16(3), 197-214.
- Purcell, B. (2013) The Emergence of "Big Data" Technology and Analytics. *Journal of Technology Research*, (4), 1-7.
- Rood, A.S.; Dziadkowiec, J. (2010) Why Use Importance Performance Analysis in Mystery Shopping? A USA-Poland Comparative Answer. *Journal of Quality Assurance in Hospitality & Tourism*. 11 (1), 1-16.
- Schiller, C.; Winters, M.; Hanson, H.M.; Ashe, M.C. (2013) A framework for Stakeholder Identification in Concept Mapping and Health Research: a Novel Process and its Application to Older Adult Mobility and the Built Environment. *BMC Public Health*. 13(1), 1-9.
- Tanrisevdi, A.; Duran, N. (2011) Comparative Evaluation of the Official Destination Websites from the Perspective of Customers. *Journal of Hospitality Marketing & Management*. 20(7), 740-765.
- Zaitseva, E.; Milsom, C.; Stewart, M. (2013) Connecting the Dots: Using Concept Maps for Interpreting Student Satisfaction. *Quality in Higher Education*. 19(2), 225-247.